CITY OF MELBOURNE

SAFE CITY CAMERAS

PROGRAM

SAFE CITY CAMERAS PROGRAM

AUDIT COMMITTEE

REPORT

1 January 2020 – 31 December 2020

Mr Dean Robertson
Director, On-street Support & Compliance
City of Melbourne
PO Box 1603M
MELBOURNE VIC 3000

Dear Mr Robertson

SAFE CITY CAMERAS PROGRAM AUDIT COMMITTEE REPORT

In accordance with the Safe City Cameras Program Audit Committee Terms of Reference, we submit our Report for the review period 1 January 2020 to 31 December 2020.

Yours sincerely,

Bill Horman AM APM	Margaret Rode	Paul Ryan
Consultant	Governance Professional	Barrister & Solicitor
Chairman	Member	Member
Appointed Chairman in 2018.	Appointed to Committee on 18/01/2018.	Appointed to Committee on 21/02/2018.

Signed................................Signed........................Rode Signed.......................

CONTENTS

1. ESTABLISHMENT OF THE SAFE CITY CAMERA PROGRAM & AUDIT COMMITTEE

On 6 December 1995, the City of Melbourne (CoM) resolved to establish a closed-circuit television system in Melbourne's Central Business District to be known as the "Safe City Cameras Program" (the Program or SCCP). The CoM SCCP became operational on 27 February 1997. The SCCP helps create a safer environment and reduce crime levels by deterring potential offenders, helping in crime detection and providing evidence to assist in investigations and/or in Court.

The Program's aims are set out in the Safe City Cameras Program Manual and include:

(a)   aiding in the provision of a safer physical environment in the Melbourne CBD

(b)   assisting police to reduce crime levels by deterring potential offenders

(c)   aiding in early identification of criminal offences

(d)   generally assisting in emergency response.

The operation of the Program is regulated by "Standard Operating Procedures (SOP's), the Training Manual" and a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with Victoria Police.

The Program Manual incorporates a Code of Practice, Privacy Principles, Product (i.e. copy of CCTV footage) tracking and release provisions and general management processes.

The Program uses closed circuit cameras (CCTV) positioned throughout the Melbourne Central Business District (CBD).

The Program is one aspect of the CoM's strategy for a safer city. Others include:

- Safe City Taxi Ranks

- Accord with Melbourne liquor licensees

- Victoria Police and CoM lighting audits

- Promotion of visible police presence throughout the CBD

- Improved transport at night to and from the CBD

- Prohibition of consumption of alcohol in CBD public places

- Education, information and awareness campaigns.

2. SCCP OPERATIONS DURING 2020 AUDIT PERIOD

Cameras in Operation

During this audit-period, 1 January 2020 to 31 December 2020 the following additional cameras were installed:

- 10 Pan Tilt Zoom (PTZ) cameras
- 16 Fixed cameras
- 01 Taxi Rank and Help Point camera.

By 31 December 2020, the SCCP had a combination of 162 cameras in the Safe City Camera Network which comprised:

- 88 Pan Tilt Zoom (PTZ) cameras
- 64 Fixed cameras
- 9 Taxi Rank cameras
- 01 Mobile CCTV Vehicle (5 cameras attached).

The additional cameras are reported to be very beneficial as illustrated by the increased amount of applicable footage for the record number of incidents recorded. The majority of the new cameras were funded by the State Government or available through the Victorian Department of Justice and Community Safety Department.

The increased number of cameras and capacity has raised the question of needing a third camera operator to the Control Room team during peak times to maximise their effectiveness and value. Whilst a challenge may be space in the room, the Committee strongly supports consideration of additional support staff to the Control Room team. Exploring advancement in technology may also assist the program moving forward.

At the time of writing this report, Corona Virus Covid-19 was severely impacting on Australia and the rest of the world. The Victoria Government during 2020 introduced tight restrictions, particularly in relation to social distancing and encouraged people to stay at home and work from home where that was possible. The City of Melbourne showed leadership in making alternate arrangements for camera operations where practical.

Significantly, a temporary back-up Control Room was established at a separate CoM location. This action by the City of Melbourne was commended by the Independent Audit Committee members[1]. The Independent Audit Committee encourages the City of Melbourne to review the practicality of making such arrangement permanent to give the Safe City Camera Program the

---

[1] Copy of letter – see Appendix A.

capacity to continue live-feed to Victoria Police of CCTV coverage of the city in the event the existing Control Room is incapacitated for whatever reason and/or cause.

Requests for information regarding the Safe City Cameras' statistics of incidents may be directed to the Melbourne City Council.

The CoM's SCCP website provides a map of locations of its cameras – but it should be noted that the location of cameras is subject to ongoing review and change.

Mobile Camera Vehicle

The Melbourne Safe City Camera Program has, in addition to fixed cameras, a Mobile Camera Vehicle, introduced in 2009. Footage from cameras in the Mobile Camera Vehicle is not directly fed to the SCCP Control Room but is downloaded at the end of each shift to the Program Management System and stored together with staff notes, running sheets and incident reports with footage from the Program's fixed cameras.

Control Room, Footage & CCTV Product

All fixed cameras feed footage, in real time, to screens located in the SCCP Control Room. Footage is recorded on the Video Management System ("VMS"). VMS screens are monitored 24 hours per day by Control Room Operators.

Control Room Operators may transfer incoming footage, in real time to dedicated monitors and control cameras to ensure detailed recording of any event. Control Room Operators notify police of incidents that they see unfolding and feed footage in real-time to Police Operation Centres.

When major events occur in Melbourne, and the State Police Operations Centre (SPOC) is operational, Control Room Operators may also feed live footage to the SPOC, while retaining control of the cameras.

Control Room Operators make electronic notes, "running sheets" and Incident Reports on a dedicated Program Management System. Such documents aid subsequent interrogation of the Incident Management System in relation to specific events and retrieval of relevant product (ie footage provided to police or others).

Footage in relation to an event is retained on the Council server for a minimum of 28 days (the Holding Period) after the event. In the absence of a request from police or other relevant agencies or individuals, it is then copied over. Should the Council receive a request for product from a relevant agency or individual within the Holding Period, two copies of the requested footage are made. One copy is provided to the requesting party and the other copy retained by Council for seven years, after which it is destroyed.

Product provided to Victoria Police

In 2016, Victoria Police and CoM agreed that police to whom product was provided would be responsible for its safe storage and ultimate destruction, when the product was no longer required by them.

Subsequently a copy of the Victoria Police instructions and procedures was provided to the Audit Committee and the SCCP Program Manual amended to incorporate the agreement.

During the 2020 review period no misuse or problem associated with product provided to Victoria Police was reported.

During 2020, 1027 copies of footage were provided to the police and there were 5234 recorded incidents.

Dedicated Police Radio Base Station

The operational benefits for the Safe City Camera Program in having a dedicated police radio base station is evidenced by the number of incidents the Control Room is alerted to via the police radio network.

CCTV Product - Dissemination Tracking and Destruction

Product continues to be made available only to those authorised under relevant provisions of the Program Manual, particularly Victoria Police, on submission of a completed Application Form.[2]   Release of product occurs only upon acceptance by applicants of necessary confidentiality, tracking, storage and destruction obligations as set out in the "Application for Access to Product" form, the Program Manual and the procedure as agreed between the City of Melbourne and Victoria Police.

The Operations Manual provides that in an emergency product may be released without a completed "Authorisation Application Form" although such a form must be completed within five days of any such release.

Applicants other than police are required to return the product to the Control Room when it is no longer required by them.

"Non-police" applicants for product are required to complete "Outcome Forms" and return them, along with the product, to the Control Room setting out the use to which the product was put and describing any "result".

The Audit Committee noted that confirmation of destruction of 61 released product remained outstanding. This matter of concern was reported on and subject of a recommendation at the

---

[2] See Page 13 of the Program Manual.

end of the Audit Report 2018. It has continued to be the subject of review during the current audit period – requiring further follow-up effort towards resolution.

Control Room

Security

Access to the Control Room is strictly limited and controlled in accordance with provisions of the Operations Training Manual.

Major Refurbishment and Second Control Room

In 2018 the SCCP Control Room underwent a major refurbishment which included change to structure, design and layout of the room and major upgrades to hardware.

Police communications via the service provider were upgraded to all Safe City 900 Base Stations and Speakers, which allow the Operators to work more effectively at their respective workstations.

In 2020 Management arranged a second temporary Control Room in response to social distancing and other safety requirements in response to COVID.

Communication with Police

Control Room Staff are in direct radio contact with police. SCCP Mobile Camera Vehicle staff are in direct contact with Control Room staff. The Audit Committee reports there is a very close working relationship between the Control Room Operators and police. There is also a close working relationship between Victoria Police and the City of Melbourne management generally in regard to planning and operational matters, particularly relating to safety, security and counter-terrorism strategies and management of emergency responses.

MOUs

Current in 2020 were CoM Memoranda of Understanding (MOU) with Victoria Police and separately, the Independent Broad-based Anti-Corruption Commission and Emergency Management Victoria.

Public Address Speakers

A Memorandum of Understanding between Victoria Police and Emergency Management Victoria (EMV) was entered into 2017 utilizing the SCCP hardware with public address speakers being fitted onto cameras at CDB locations to be used in emergency situations.

The speakers can be used to provide an audible warning sound and a message from police to the public in an emergency situation. The speakers were not required to be used during 2020.

Victoria Police Monitoring Assessment Centre

Since December 2016, the Victoria Police Monitoring Assessment Centre (MAC) has been able to select live-feeds from CCTV cameras in the CBD.

In view of the importance of the role of the Victoria Police MAC, its relationship with the SCCP and the live-use of SCCP footage, the Audit Committee maintains its interest in being kept informed as to any relevant impacts on the arrangements.

The Chairman and an Audit Committee members visited the Victoria Police Monitoring Assessment Centre in 2018 and in 2019 and were provided with a detailed overview of its operations, access and use of the live SCCP camera coverage. COVID restrictions prevented site visits in 2020.

Major Incidents in CBD

Major incidents in the CBD put the SCCP Operators and managers as well as CoM management, administration, practices and procedures, under significant test.

The Audit Committee noted that during this audit period, there were many instances where the Control Room Operators alerted police to the commission of offences, or assisted police investigators in live time or provided evidence as required.

City Safety- the Counter-Terrorism Environment & the SCCP

Major incidents in recent years involving vehicles posing a threat to the lives and safety of CBD users, demonstrating the importance of the SCCP in prevention, deterrence, critical incident response and providing footage to form part of the police investigation as well as evidence when matters are before the Coroner or criminal prosecutions proceed to Court.

COVID restrictions meant reduced pedestrian and vehicle activity as well as other public safety threats throughout much of 2020.

Complaints

The CoM website provides advice for members of the public to facilitate complaints about the Program operation.

The Program Manual also sets out a process by which complaints can be made about the operation of the Program.[3]

Any complaint lodged against the SCCP is the subject of focus by the Audit Committee.

---

[3] Safe City Cameras Program Manual p.16

One complaint was received in 2020. This complaint in November 2020 was from the Melb West Local Area Police Commander that footage not released in timely manner. The Committee was advised that following an investigation a Control Room Operator was counselled

Disparity between Program's Aims & Operating Procedures

The complaint from the Melb. West Local Area Commander mentioned in relation to delay about footage not released in a timely manner was also viewed by SCCP Management as Evidence of Disparity between the Program's aims, protocols and operating procedures.

Freedom of Information

FOI requests lodged relevant to the SCCP are a subject of focus by the Audit Committee.

One Freedom of Information request relevant to the SCCP was lodged during 2020.

The Freedom of Information request was received in November 2020 in relation to footage relevant to a Parking Officer's injuries. It was found there was no applicable footage

Victorian Auditor-General's 2018 Review of CCTV Camera Operations

During 2018 the Victorian Auditor-General's Office (VAGO) carried out an extensive review of the Public Safety and Corporate CCTV cameras of a number of local governments including the City of Melbourne's Safe City Camera Program.

The VAGO report *"Security and Privacy of Surveillance Technologies in Public Places - September 2018"* can be found here:

https://www.audit.vic.gov.au/sites/default/files/2018-09/20180919-Surveillance-Technologies-in-Public-Places.pdf

While the VAGO report was generally favourable, the Audit Committee noted there were areas where the SCCP (Public Safety CCTV) was not fully compliant and made recommendations addressing those issues. The recommendations have been progressively implemented and reported on.

3. SCCP CCTV Audit Committee

Establishment

CoM made the Program's operation subject to audit against its protocols and operating procedures by an independent committee called the Melbourne Safe City Camera Audit Committee The Audit Committee is required to report to the CoM annually pursuant to the Committee's Terms of Reference. The Report is available to the public.

Independent auditing of the Program's operation is intended to:

(a)   ensure congruence between the Program's operation and the parameters set out in the Operations and Training Manual and the Program Manual;

(b)   promote public confidence in the Program by making its operation transparent and accountable;

(c)   ensure the Program's efficient, effective operation and management;

(d)   support continuous improvement of the program through consideration and implementation of Audit Committee recommendations ; and

(e)   identify any incidents of non-compliance with the terms of the Operations and Training Manual or the Program Manual.

From inception, the CoM SCCP Audit Committee has been and continues to be independent of the Program operation.

Membership 2020

During the 2020 audit period the three member independent SCCP Audit Committee consisted of long-serving member Mr Bill Horman AM APM who was appointed Chairman, with 2018 appointees, Ms Margaret Rode (Governance Professional and Community Representative) and Mr Paul Ryan (Solicitor).

Meetings of SCCP Audit Committee 2020

During 2020 the SCCP Audit Committee met on the following dates, using electronic means from April onwards, as a consequence of COVID restrictions:

- 12 February 2020
- 8 April 2020
- 10 June 2020
- 12 August 2020
- 14 October 2020
- 9 December 2020.

Between formal Committee meetings, the Chairman communicated with the independent members of the Audit Committee. The independent members consider the "catch-up" discussions to be valuable and wish to resume meeting face-to-face on a regular basis between formal meetings of the Audit Committee when COVID restrictions allow.

A schedule of meetings and attendees is attached: see Appendix B.

Support to SCCP Audit Committee

The Audit Committee wishes to express its appreciation for support throughout the audit period, provided by:

- Mr Dean Robertson, City of Melbourne Director On-street Support and Compliance

- Ms Christine Drummond, City of Melbourne Emergency Management Coordinator

- Mr Craig Buckingham, City of Melbourne Team Leader Security Services

- Victoria Police, the biggest single-user of the Program product,[4] was represented at all meetings of the CCTV Audit Committee which significantly enhanced discussions, including police use of Product and police interaction with the Control Room. The Police representatives report at each meeting outlining some aspects of crime and particular incidents involving the police and SCCP and Control Room.

    The Police representatives were:

    - Senior Sergeants from Melbourne West attended various meetings as a consequence of Senior Sergeant Mick Wilmott (a regular attendee over several years), being assigned by Victoria Police to other roles from time to time, (including as Acting Inspector) and not available:
    - Senior Sergeant Andrew Brady – representing Melbourne East
    - Other police members who attended meeting during 2020 were:
        o Senior Sergeant Colin Provan; and
        o Senior Sergeant Megan O'Sullivan.

Continuity of police representation is viewed as important by the Audit Committee members and involvement was consistent throughout 2020.

Of particular value to the Committee throughout the audit period were Mr Buckingham's monthly Program Management Reports containing statistics, comparisons, and commentary on incidents; as well as reports containing statistics on hits on the website provided by Ms Drummond.

---

[4] CCTV recorded material.

4. SCCP AUDIT COMMITTEE – EXECUTIVE SUMMARY 2020

CoM Response to Recommendations set out in 2019 Report

At each Audit Committee meeting, the CoM reported on the progress/completion of each of the 2019 Report's recommendations.

Summary of SCCP activity in 2020

The CCTV Audit Committee found that the Safe City Camera Program operated efficiently and effectively throughout the review period.

COVID restrictions on freedom of movement through the major part of 2020 resulted in some changes in the types of incidents detected and police activity in the Melbourne CBD.

During the review period, the SCCP recorded a record total of 5234, down from 5711 in the same period in 2019 – but the impact of COVID-19 with some form of stay at home restrictions for a combined period of 16 weeks. It should also be noted that the lack of people on the streets may have impacted on the types of incidents coming to notice. The lack of people in the streets in some instances made it harder for alleged offenders to conceal their crimes and easier for Operators to observe or review footage.

The five (5) most reported incident categories during 2020 were:

(i)	Public Order	1,007 incidents down from 1,417
(ii)	Assault	708 Incidents down from 869
(iii)	Theft/Attempted Theft	680 Incidents up from 565
(iv)	Traffic-related matters	580 incidents up from 196
(v)	Welfare Checks	535 Incidents down from 661
Note:	Drug-related matters	300 Incidents up from 193

In 2020 the SCCP provided 1027 copies of footage to the police, higher than in 2019 (1011) and was the highest amount of footage ever distributed in a year.   Incidents to footage ratio was 5:1.

Findings 2020

The Safe City Camera Program Audit Committee reviewed the operation of the Melbourne Safe City Camera Program for the period 1 January 2020 to 31 December 2020 in accordance with

its Terms of Reference and the relevant provisions of both the Program Manual and the Training Manual.[5]

The Committee found:

(i)   One incidence of disparity between the Program's aims, protocols and operating procedures - arising from a complaint on 2 November 2020 of untimely release of footage. After an internal investigation an Operator was counselled.

(ii)   Only the one complaint about the Program was made during 2020.

(iii)   No other evidence of failure by SCCP staff to observe security protocols and standard operating procedures as set out in the Training Manual.

(iv)   The Program and its operations were effectively and efficiently managed and coordinated.

(v)   There were no new major events requiring the supply of cameras into either the Melbourne Events Operations Centre or the State Government Operations Centre.

(vi)   No evidence that Control Room Operators' entries on the Program Management System failed to comply with the requirements set out in the provisions of the Operations and Training. The level of detail of such entries continues to be satisfactory.

(vii)   No evidence of access to the Control Room outside the scope of the standard operating procedures and security protocols.

(viii)   Program staff maintained professional, cordial, efficient and effective interaction with authorised persons including police, other stakeholders and members of the public who visited the SCCP Control Room.

(ix)   No evidence of improper dissemination or use made of any Product.

(x)   No members of the public or stakeholders raised any public interest issues.

(xi)   There was 1 Freedom of Information request relating to a Parking Officer's injures – but no relevant footage was found.

Relationship with Victoria Police, CoM Staff – impacts of COVID

The relationship between Victoria Police and the SCCP is crucial to its effectiveness and, ultimately, city safety and security.

---

[5] The Training Manual includes Standard Operating Procedures.

The Audit Committee commends the high level of communication and co-operation between Control Room Operators and members of Victoria Police and other emergency services personnel.

The Audit Committee particularly commends the Program staff and City of Melbourne Management on the way they rapidly and effectively adapted to changed circumstances and requirements resulting from COVID 19 and its severe impacts on people's working and personal lives in 2020.

The Chair forwarded a letter of commendation, on behalf of the Independent Members of the Safe City Camera Program Audit Committee. A copy of the letter is attached to this report: see Appendix A.

5. CONSIDERATIONS FOR CITY OF MELBOURNE AND THE FORTHCOMING REVIEW PERIOD

2020 SCCP Audit Committee's Recommendations

The following recommendations are put forward by the Audit Committee 2020 for consideration by the City of Melbourne, Victoria Police and for attention of the SCCP Audit Committee in 2021.

1. In conjunction with the City of Melbourne, carry out an audit of signage displayed near SCCP cameras to the effect that *"for safety and security reasons this area is under electronic surveillance".* (The intention to carry out such an audit in conjunction with the SCCP was thwarted by the COVID-19 restrictions).

2. Independent members of the Audit Committee to visit the Melbourne East Police Station (previously agreed, but again delayed due to COVID Restrictions during 2020), including inspection of the Police recording of:

    i. receipt, and

    ii. disposal of SCCP "Product".

3. Inspect operation of the SCCP Mobile Camera Vehicle.

4. Seek advice on the availability/feasability of technology to enable direct-feed from the SCCP Mobile Camera Vehicle to the Control Room.

5. Visit and inspect the SCCP Control Room and report on security practices including:

    i. signing in/out of visitors

    ii. secure storage of CCTV product

    iii. signing out and signing back in of any Product

14

6. In conjunction with the City of Melbourne and Victoria Police, seek information and advice in relation to:

    I.   technology developments to aid electronic transfer and recording of CCTV footage/product, in lieu of CD discs; and

    II.   amendment of existing Policy/Procedures and training to reflect any such change.

7. Continue to seek a copy of the Perth City CCTV Cameras Report to explore any possible learnings

8. To explore, in conjunction with the City of Melbourne, possible change to the format of the annual SCCP Audit Committee Report to include more information relevant to serving community interest.

9. In conjunction with the City of Melbourne, seek advice in relation to the training for SCCP Control Room Operators and the provision of counselling and/or other support in view of the role's potential stress and trauma to Operators.

10. The City of Melbourne continue to consider the operation of a second SCCP Control Room (as established in 2020) at a different location, to minimize the risk to staff and operators of COVID infection, and to enable the Safe City Cameras to continue to be operated if the main SCCP Control Room becomes out of action for any reason, in the event of extreme disruption to the City of Melbourne and significant danger to the community.

It is pointed out the serious impact of COVID-19 and its restriction had considerable impact on Melbourne during 2020 and indications are RESTRICTIONS may continue into 2021. The consequences include the likely impact on the ability to implement some of the Recommendations in the ANNUAL SCCP CCTV AUDIT COMMITTEE 2020 REPORT.

HORMAN-Consultant & Network Services

BILL HORMAN AM APM

HORMAN-Consultant & Network Services
ABN 78615845427
Mobile: 0411 403 440
Email : bill@horman.net.au

Mr Dean Robertson
Manager On-street Support & Compliance Services
CITY OF MELBOURNE

cc: Ms Linda Weatherson
  Director Community & City Services

APPRECIATION & COMMENDATION
CITY OF MELBOURNE & MELBOURNE SAFE CITY PROGRAM TEAM
Throughout COVID19 Pandemic 2020

Australia, the State of Victoria and Melbourne and our communities throughout the majority of this year 2020 suffered greatly as a consequence of the COVID19 Pandemic and especially since March when stringent restrictions were introduced.   Clearly the pandemic and the restrictions presented many challenges to the City of Melbourne including its important aim to keep the city safe and accepting that the Melbourne Safe City Camera Program (SCCP) plays a significant role in efforts to help achieve that objective.

As Chairman, on behalf of the Melbourne Safe City Camera Program's CCTV Audit Committee, the Committee wishes to advise the City of Melbourne of our appreciation of its efforts and we especially commend Manager On-street Support & Compliance Services Mr Dean Robertson, Ms Christine Drummond, Emergency Management Coordinator/MEMO| On-street Support &Compliance and SCCP Mr Craig Buckingham, Team Leader Security Services | On-street Support & Compliance - for their initiatives, efforts and, importantly, the outcomes and results achieved.

The Committee noted the decision to establish the second/back-up Control Room which effectively divided the operational 24/7 staffing of the Control Room and operations whilst importantly reducing the risk of infection amongst the SCCP personnel.   No doubt this placed greater pressure on management including on Manager Mr Dean Robertson, Co-ordinator Ms Christine Drummond, Manager Craig Buckingham and the entire SCCP team which continued to operate efficiently and effectively regardless of the concerns and inconvenience caused by the "once in our life-time" COVID Pandemic and the restrictions.

We are proud of and in awe of the efforts of the entire SCCP team and its management which continued to serve the City of Melbourne and community laudably – WELL DONE.

Yours sincerely

BILL HORMAN AM APM
Chairman SCCP Audit Committee

HORMAN-Consultant & Network Services
Mobile: 0411 403 440
Email:bill@horman.net.au

9th December 2020

Schedule of Meetings 2020 – dates and attendance

Dates of Meeting

Member	12/02/20	08/04/20	10/06/20	12/08/20	14/10/20	08/12/20
BH	✓	✓ 6	✓	✓	✓	✓
MR		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
PR	✓	✓	✓	✓	A	✓
CD	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
CB	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
DR	✓	✓	✓	A	✓	✓
MW	A	A		✓	A	✓
AB	✓		✓	✓	A	✓
CP		✓	A			
MOS					✓	

INDEPENDENT MEMBERS
BH   BILL HORMAN (Chair)
MR   MARGARET RODE
PR   PAUL RYAN

CITY OF MELBOURNE
CH   CHRISTINE DRUMMOND
CB   CRAIG BUCKINGHAM
DR   DEAN ROBERTSON

POLICE
MW   Senior Sergeant MICHAEL WILMOTT
AB   Senior Sergeant ANDREW BRADY
CP   Senior Sergeant COLIN PROVAN
MOS Senior Sergeant Megan O'SULLIVAN

---

[6] Chair Bill Horman experienced technical problem with online meeting and had audio but no visual and unable to communicate at the time